

THE CORPORATION OF THE TOWNSHIP OF HORTON

Lime Stabilization Committee

January 25, 2011

There was a meeting of the Lime Stabilization Committee held in the Municipal Council chambers on Tuesday January 25, 2011. Present were Chair Bob Kingsbury, Mayor Don Eady, Bruce Golden, David Brown, Tom Reid, Reginald Laventure and George Thompson. Also present were Robert A. Johnston and David Bennett who were member of the Committee previously. Staff present was Jeff Schruder Municipal Infrastructure Manager and Mackie McLaren CAO/Clerk. Also present was Dave Darch, Public Works and Engineering Director for the County of Renfrew.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Kingsbury called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

He welcomed Dave Darch to the meeting. He said the purpose of this meeting is to decide what direction we are going in to create a presentation to the Ministry of the Environment on our request for additional funding while our representatives are at the ROMA/OGRA conference in February.

Chair Kingsbury also welcomed Dave Bennett and Bob Johnston to the meeting as they were involved from the start of our Lime Stabilization project and will have knowledge of the changes in scope required by the Ministry of the Environment.

Chair Kingsbury noted that Mackie McLaren, Dave Bennett and himself will revisit the financial numbers report prepared in December 2010.

2. INFORMATION FOR DRAFT PRESENTATION.

Chair Kingsbury requested Dave Darch lead this discussion. Dave Darch said the County had a roll in the pilot projects when they received the Provincial funds and allocated them to Horton and Bonnechere Valley Townships. The funds were allocated on the basis of cost of the facility. A second round of funding was received to bring the Province total allocation for both projects to \$205,000. Horton's contribution to the project was originally \$25,000 but they spent \$101,009 over and above the Provincial funding. Where were the extra costs incurred.

Dave Darch noted that Bonnechere Valley had overruns. They tried for additional funding because of bad field conditions which drove up the costs. They were not successful. If we approached the Ministry setting out the original Terms of Reference and listing the changes in scope the Ministry later required, we could have a stronger argument for recovery of some of the overruns. He said to focus on the changes, ask what the Ministry's expectation by Tony Ho was, then determine what changed.

He suggested we take a careful look at the agreement on funding arrangements – how they phrased the terms of funding. Then cost out the change in direction.

Dave Bennett said when Tony Ho and the County came on board, it was full speed ahead. Then came the need for a certificate of approval which put the project 16 months behind which increased the construction costs by at least 10%.

George Thompson said originally MOE considered the product of the treatment to be a nutrient. No approvals were to be required. But later came the need for a Soils Conditioning Permit and a full Certificate of Approval process.

Dave Darch asked if the need for these approvals should have been known by the municipality. George Thompson suggested that if the Ministry told us a different requirement we would have said whoa to the project back then. Dave Bennett noted that the original plan included the Township of Admaston Bromley as they wanted the treated septage for a nutrient management trial.

Dave Darch said the delay in acquiring the Certificates of Approval when none were originally required would then add 10% to construction costs. The Committee agreed that the costs would be **\$15,000**

Dave Bennett discussed the cost of acquiring the certificates. \$1330 was in the budget but the actual cost was \$8105.00. It is reported in the Committee Meeting Minutes that Tony Ho of MOE (now retired) stated MOE would handle these costs **\$6,000**

Bruce Golden noted that when Mr. Ho retired, no one with his experience and leadership stepped forward from the Ministry.

George Thompson noted that MOE was going to test the water but suggest when we took our first samples that they should be sent to a private lab. Each full test is approximately \$2,700 at the private lab and would have been free to us at the MOE Lab in Toronto. The MOE lab now tests our water and sludge but we had three rounds of testing we paid for. **\$8,000**

Dave Darch said we would need copies of the meeting minutes to substantiate our claims.

George Thompson said that we originally told by MOE that we had to test the septage when the two underground tanks were full. However, when we started to receive the septage we were told to test every 4<sup>th</sup> load of septage as it was being dumped into the receiving tank. We have completed 5 tests at \$100 each **\$500**

Dave Bennett said the MOE were originally satisfied with a certified septic tank for our 2-10,000 underground tanks. But following the protests, the MOE requested a leaching bed type system with crushed rock and leaching pipes to channel any leakage to a manhole for inspection and pump out. This leaching bed cost us engineering fees that originally were not required. **\$3,000**

George Thompson added that if there hadn't been a holdup, we would have completed the tests with the tanks as they were planned. Dave Bennett said that the manufacture certifies that the tanks are certified septic tanks which could go into the ground and received septic wastes anywhere in Ontario.

Dave Darch said after the protests caused delay, what was the cost to provide the leak catchment system? Dave Bennett suggested **\$10,000**

Dave Bennett said time was lost because of the landowners' demonstration on the first day of construction which delayed the project 3 months. He will check and see if there is a cost argument.

Dave Bennett said that training was to be supplied by Tony Ho but in the end we had to pay for the training to receive, treat and spread the waste. He suggested that the minutes of meetings confirming this would be at the County as the commitment was made during a County Committee Meeting in February or March 2006. **\$4,000**

Dave Darch said the municipality will have to document each of these claims for reimbursement due to the change in scope by MOE. We need to create a report in a list format with documents attached. He suggested that MOE will want to be certain that they don't open the door for additional funding for Bonnechere Valley's Geo-tube pilot project if they fund our request. We have to stress that these claims are costs that we had no idea we would be required to pay for.

Reg Laventure asked if the MOE will charge a licence fee to other municipalities to build the same facility we have built and proven. If they do, the licence fees would be a recovery to the costs they would reimburse us for. Dave Darch said that the Ministry would not charge a licence fee for the design.

Dave Darch asked if this approach satisfies everyone. The Committee Members said yes. Mayor Eady said the reasons we listed above are good solid reasons.

Dave Darch asked who is preparing the draft presentation. It was decided that Councillor Bob Kingsbury, Dave Bennett, Mayor Don Eady and Mackie McLaren would draft the document for discussion. Dave Darch reminded us that the reason for this funding request is that the scope of the project was changed by the Ministry of the Environment, which is the contributing factor to the extra costs borne by the municipality.

George Thompson asked if it would be helpful to bring up that the Ministry originally was supplying the testing at the start of the project but now we are doing it which may give grounds that they were originally responsible.

#### Presentation

Dave Darch said he would be available at the ROMA/OGRA convention to assist with the presentation. He suggested that the presentation lead should be from Horton. He will provide support. After discussion he agreed to review the draft presentation and together we can make a decision on who presents the request to the Minister.

Chair Kingsbury thanked Dave Darch for attending this meeting and assisting us.

#### Opportunity for third spread this fall

Chair Kingsbury informed the Committee that Bryan Dickman, local MOE representative informed us that there is enough time to carry out a fall spread in 2011 before the final report is drafted. This will permit us to carry out the originally approved 3 spreading events.

Moved by George Thompson, Seconded by David Brown that the Lime Stabilization Committee recommend to Council that the Township provide a third spread of treated septage in the fall of 2011 before the final report is drafted.

Carried.

### 3. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Reg Laventure, Seconded by Robert A. Johnston that this Committee Meeting be adjourned at 11:00 a.m.

Carried.