

THE CORPORATION OF THE TOWNSHIP OF HORTON
Public Works Committee
April 2, 2015

There was a Special Meeting of the Public Works Committee held in the Municipal Council Chamber on Friday April 2, 2015. Present was Chair Dave Bennett, Vice Chair Jamey Larone, Mayor Robert Kingsbury and Members Murray Humphries and Rick Lester. Staff present was Public Works Manager Janet Collins and CAO/Clerk Mackie McLaren.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Bennett called the Meeting to Order at 9:01 a.m.

2. DECLARATION OF PECUNIARY INTEREST

There was no declaration of pecuniary interest by Members of the Committee or Staff.

3. BUSINESS PLAN FOR THOMSON ROAD

- Presentation by Public Works Manager

Janet Collins, Public Works Manager presented a draft business plan for the rehabilitation of Thomson Road she prepared with input from the Treasurer. The CAO/Clerk informed the Members that this draft is meant to start the discussion by the members on their Business Plan. Ms. Collins briefly highlighted sections of the draft plan. She referred to the following Appendices that are part of the draft:

Appendix 1-A is a compilation of tender results from the County and neighbouring municipalities that she used to arrive at a unit or lump sum cost for various parts of the project.

Appendix 1 – B is a cost per metre to do the work using lump sum costs for tendered projects, as well as AMP data. She noted that the data needs to be examined as each project used for background costs is different, i.e. they did not replace deep culverts as is required on Thomson Road.

Appendix 1 – C is information on 13 cross-culverts, 1 side road culvert, and entrance culverts installed on Thomson Road, including estimated costs taken from past Horton projects and various tenders. She noted that she used the Provincial Tender Price Index to determine the 2015 cost for the first culvert replaced on Thomson Road in 2005.

Appendix 1 – D is estimated cost for Thomson Road project using the unit prices from the previous appendixes to arrive at an estimated cost.

Appendix 1 – E is a blank worksheet for the Committee Members to develop their Business Plan.

- Discussion by Members:

Vice Chair Larone, also Chair of the Finance Committee, advised that he spoke with Jennifer Barr, Treasurer. Finance Committee will meet within 2 weeks to consider several scenarios that will affect the budget. One issue is this project.

Rick Lester asked if it was a safe assumption that a debenture would be required to complete the project. He asked if a grant application would be looked at favorably.

Vice Chair Larone said if you go back to the February 13, 2105 Committee Minutes, there is a motion that states not to use outside engineering services. Since that time all Council Members attended a training workshop and the learned that we would put Horton into harms risk by not getting the engineering design for this project. If this adds \$150,000 to the project it is not much spread over the life of the road. The last road lasted 40 plus years.

Mayor Kingsbury spoke on engineering costs. He asked if the engineering cost data provided by the Public Works Manager included all engineering costs. Ms. Collins said that there could be additional costs i.e. heritage review, etc. if required, which could raise the 2013 engineering estimate.

Rick Lester said the Committee has to decide on Council's appetite to debenture. Is this something we have to wait for a comment from Finance Committee?

Vice Chair Larone said we can move forward with developing this business plan. This will show Finance Committee and Council what work we desire to be carried out in 2015 and forward. He added that the Township is in a good financial situation compared to other municipalities in the Province.

Mayor Kingsbury said he originally did not support more debentures, but after speaking to others, he understands that we are not getting grants in the future because of our Fiscal Index. We will have to look at borrowing.

Vice Chair Larone said we have \$1.2 million in reserves that we could use, but this is not a practice that we want to do.

Murray Humphries said we have other capital projects i.e. Thompsonville roads and streets which will soon be in the same shape as Thomson Road. He said he sees the estimates as more detailed than needs to be – there is more rehabilitation than reconstruction to be carried out. He suggested that the other road projects used to provide the average cost per metre to carry out the Thomson Road work have different designs. We need costs that are specific to this road. We have to examine now what we do with the culverts. Do we replace or not. The road base is well built or the road wouldn't have lasted this long. Work like topsoil and ditching can be carried out through the regular maintenance road budget.

Vice Chair Larone said he supported the business plan principle. The plan takes the scope of work and what you want to accomplish into the consideration. It fills in a lot of the blanks. The Committee asked for a cost per kilometer and this was provided by staff. The Public Works Manager has gone into a lot detail in the supporting documents. He will have to spend some time reviewing.

Mayor Kingsbury agreed saying he acknowledged the work Ms. Collins put into the draft. He asked what the intentions of the Committee were for this meeting.

Chair Bennett said he doesn't believe he has received what he has asked for but appreciated the work Ms. Collins has carried out. He said he needs the cost for grinding, the cost for crushing our own gravel, we can take a very good look at the project to see what costs are high.

Janet Collins said that using the unit costs provided (Appendix 1-A) that the project selected by the PWC can be estimated. However, staff continues to receive variations from Committee members regarding the scope of work, making it difficult to estimate. She reviewed the numbers presented, and confirmed that the costs presented are reasonable but are subject to change based on the scope of work i.e. replace all culverts, only replace deep culverts, rehabilitate a portion of the road (where/how much; based on what criteria), phase construction, etc. She indicated that the Consultant's 2013 proposal estimated that 25% of the road required reconstruction while 75% only needed rehabilitation work, similar to what Mr. Humphries was recommending.

Rick Lester asked questions of Chair Bennett's proposal. He suggested that we put out a tender out for the deep culvert replacement right away. Once these are completed we could move to the surface work.

Chair Bennett said this is not the way that the township can save money. Can we purchase all the culverts in bulk to save money? We have a gravel pit close by, some of the cost estimate per kilometre is based on other projects where gravel was hauled 30 km.

Rick Lester said we have to fix the culverts first. We have identified the cost for this. After this is completed we could decide on the road platform. We can't replace the culverts in house as we need large equipment.

Vice Chair Larone asked if there was a reason the township couldn't purchase the culverts directly. We would have to determine the size, length, number etc. Janet Collins said yes we could purchase the culverts as we purchase them all the time. Vice Chair Larone asked if we could attack the project in this fashion that identifies the materials we have? Janet asked if we know what project we want we can get a price for grinding. She requires some direction.

Rick Lester asked if it is a wish on our part to just replace all the culverts or leave some for future replacement. Vice Chair Larone said he sees us replacing them all.

Mayor Kingsbury asked if it possible to have a professional examine the culverts to determine if they had to be replaced. Ms. Collins said she has met with 2 contractors. Murray Humphries had met with one. There is a possibility that 1 culvert can be slip lined. Slip lining with a plastic insert costs 60% of the cost to replace a steel culvert.

Murray Humphries said he viewed all the deep culverts with a contractor.

Chair Bennett said the quality of the culverts installed in the road bed are three times the quality of the culverts made today. Murray Humphries agreed.

Mayor Kingsbury said we would need some kind of proof that for the culverts to remain they would have to have a life expectancy remaining of "X" years. Janet Collins said that staff cannot do this. She would recommend that a professional review is required. Chair Bennett said that checking the quality of the culvert is not a big thing. A machine is available to rent which can determine the thickness of the culvert wall.

Mayor Kingsbury asked who can do this test. Chair Bennett said we can do it as the equipment can be rented by the week. Mayor Kingsbury suggested we do this. Murray Humphries added that there are some culverts that definitely have to be replaced.

Rick Lester suggested that as we know there are culverts that have to be replaced that we just go ahead and send out a tender for those culverts.

Chair Bennett said that culverts require gravel. Therefore we would need to know whether we can use our own pit material first. Savings on "B" gravel from our pit, as long as it is tested to be sufficient to use as "B" gravel could save us 60% on gravel costs.

Rick Lester asked what should we do starting now. Chair Bennett said the Public Works Manager could determine the cost to produce "A" gravel from our pit, get a price for the culverts, check to see the savings in cost. If we can't save on the costs as he hopes, it will be up to the Finance Committee and Council to determine if we can ever do this project. Janet Collins said this information can be prepared.

Murray Humphries asked if we would reduce the platform width of the road from the current 6.6 metre width to 6.1 metre plus extra width on the curves. Would we require a 2" lift of asphalt instead of the 1.5" lift that is there now. He asked what the Provincial OPS standards required. Ms. Collins said we do not have a Standards book. She estimated that it would cost approximately \$1,000 to purchase a set. Chair Bennett said we need to purchase this standards book.

Moved by Jamey Larone Seconded by Rick Lester that the Public Works Committee authorize the Public Works Manager purchase a full set of the Provincial OPS Standard Manuals.

Carried.

In summary, the Members requested the following information be gathered for the next Committee meeting, February 16, 2015:

- Gravel quantities
- Cost to purchase all the culverts
- Research the cost of the rental agreement and operating methods of a "fluoroscope" which is available from a company in Montreal.

- Develop Business Plan

The Members agreed that they were not in a position to develop the business plan at this point in time.

- Recommendation to Finance Committee

The Members agreed that they were not in a position to make a recommendation to Finance Committee.

4. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Bennett declared the Meeting to be adjourned at 11:20 a.m.

CHAIR

CAO/Clerk